

CSBA Sample

Board Bylaw

Closed Session Purposes And Agendas

BB 9321

Board Bylaws

Note: Pursuant to Government Code 54962, the Governing Board may hold a closed session only for purposes expressly authorized by the Brown Act (Government Code 54950-54963) or by a provision of the Education Code.

The Governing Board is committed to complying with state open meeting laws and modeling transparency in its conduct of district business. The Board shall hold closed sessions only for purposes authorized by law. A closed session may be held during a regular, special, or emergency meeting in accordance with law.

Note: Government Code 54954.5 provides specific agenda descriptions for most closed session items authorized by the Brown Act.

Each agenda shall contain a general description of each closed session item to be discussed at the meeting, as required by law. (Government Code 54954.2)

(cf. 9320 - Meetings and Notices)

(cf. 9322 - Agenda/Meeting Materials)

Note: Government Code 54957.7 states that before holding any closed session, the Board must disclose in an open meeting the item(s) to be discussed in the closed session. The Board may either state the information on the agenda or refer the public to the item(s) as listed by number or letter on the agenda. These disclosures may be made at the location announced in the agenda for the closed session, as long as the public is allowed to be present at that location for the purpose of hearing the announcements. In addition, the Board is required to reconvene in open session upon conclusion of a closed session to report any action taken in the closed session.

The Board shall disclose in open session the items to be discussed in closed session. In the closed session, the Board may consider only those matters covered in its statement. After the closed session, the Board shall reconvene in open session before adjourning the meeting, and when applicable, shall disclose any action taken in the closed session, in the manner prescribed by Government Code 54957.1. (Government Code 54957.7)

(cf. 9321.1 - Closed Session Actions and Reports)

Attachment B - Use CSBA Sample As Is

The Board shall not disclose any information that is protected by state or federal law. In addition, no victim or alleged victim of tortious sexual conduct or child abuse shall be identified in any Board agenda, notice, announcement, or report required by the Brown Act, unless the identity of the person has previously been publicly disclosed. (Government Code 54957.7, 54961)

(cf. 1340 - Access to District Records)

Note: Pursuant to Government Code 54963, a Board member who discloses confidential information received in a closed session may be referred to the local grand jury or may be subject to action in a court of law. For a definition of confidential information and the actions that may be taken against a Board member if such information is disclosed, see BB 9011 - Disclosure of Confidential/Privileged Information.

A Board member shall not disclose confidential information received in a closed session unless the Board authorizes the disclosure of that information. (Government Code 54963)

(cf. 9011 - Disclosure of Confidential/Privileged Information)

Personnel Matters

Note: Government Code 54957 authorizes the use of closed sessions for personnel matters described below. For the purpose of these closed sessions, "employee" includes an officer or independent contractor who functions as an officer or employee but excludes Board members. The Attorney General has concluded that it is appropriate to use a closed session to discuss and evaluate Superintendent performance. (59 Ops.Cal.Atty.Gen. 532 (1976)) However, under the "personnel exception," the Board may not discuss or act upon any proposed change in compensation other than a reduction of compensation that results from the imposition of discipline in closed session under this exception.

Note: In Fischer v. Los Angeles Unified School District, the court interpreted Government Code 54957 and found that the right to request an open session applies only when the Board hears specific complaints or charges brought against the employee. Thus, the right to request an open session does not apply when the Board is meeting in closed session to consider the appointment, employment, evaluation of performance, discipline, or dismissal of an employee.

The Board may hold a closed session under the "personnel exception" to consider the appointment, employment, evaluation of performance, discipline, or dismissal of an employee. Such a closed session shall not include discussion or action on proposed compensation except for a reduction of compensation that results from the imposition of discipline. (Government Code 54957)

Comment [WT1]: Added clarification

(cf. 2140 - Evaluation of the Superintendent)

(cf. 4115 - Evaluation/Supervision)

(cf. 4118 - Suspension/Disciplinary Action)

(cf. 4215 - Evaluation/Supervision)

Attachment B - Use CSBA Sample As Is

(cf. 4218 - Dismissal/Suspension/Disciplinary Action)
(cf. 4315 - Evaluation/Supervision)

Note: Pursuant to Government Code 54957, failure of the Board to give an employee against whom a "specific complaint or charge" has been made the notice described below will render any action taken by the Board in the closed session null and void. Determining whether a "specific complaint or charge" is involved is usually fact-specific and the Board should consult legal counsel as necessary. In *Furtado v. Sierra Community College District*, the court held that the term "specific complaints or charges" as used in Government Code 54957 does not include negative comments in an employee's performance evaluation. In another decision, *Bell v. Vista Unified School District*, the court determined that a presentation to the board by a district staff member regarding an employee's violation of a California Interscholastic Federation rule constituted a "complaint or charge" and thus the employee was entitled to 24-hour notice. Yet another ruling, *Morrison v. Housing Authority of the City of Los Angeles Board of Commissioners*, held that when a board rejects its hearing officer's findings of fact and conducts its own hearing, the employee must be given 24-hour notice.

Note: Furthermore, an Attorney General opinion (78 Ops.Cal.Atty.Gen. 218 (1995)) has clarified that a probationary certificated employee does not have the right to an open session when the Board is discussing whether or not to reemploy him/her for a third consecutive school year. Education Code 44929.21 allows the Board to non-reelect a probationary certificated employee at the end of the first or second school year as long as written notice is given in accordance with law; see AR 4117.6 - Decision Not to Rehire.

The Board may also hold a closed session to hear complaints or charges brought against an employee by another person or employee, unless the employee requests an open session. Before the Board holds a closed session on specific complaints or charges brought against an employee, the employee shall receive written notice of his/her right to have the complaints or charges heard in open session if desired. This notice shall be delivered personally or by mail at least 24 hours before the time of the session. (Government Code 54957)

(cf. 1312.1 - Complaints Concerning District Employees)
(cf. 4112.9/4212.9/4312.9 - Employee Notifications)

The Board may hold a closed session to discuss a district employee's application for early withdrawal of funds in a deferred compensation plan when the application is based on financial hardship arising from an unforeseeable emergency due to illness, accident, casualty, or other extraordinary event, as specified in the deferred compensation plan. (Government Code 54957.10)

Agenda items related to district employee appointments and employment shall describe the position to be filled. Agenda items related to performance evaluations shall specify the title of the employee being reviewed. Agenda items related to employee discipline, dismissal, or release require no additional information. (Government Code 54954.5)

Attachment B - Use CSBA Sample As Is

Negotiations/Collective Bargaining

Note: The Educational Employment Relations Act (Government Code 3540-3549.3) makes four specific exemptions from the Brown Act related to negotiations. Government Code 54957.6 provides that for the purpose of closed sessions related to collective bargaining, "employee" includes an officer or independent contractor who functions as an officer or employee but excludes any elected official, Board member, or other independent contractor.

Unless otherwise agreed upon by the parties involved, the following shall not be subject to the Brown Act: (Government Code 3549.1)

1. Any meeting and negotiating discussion between the district and a recognized or certified employee organization
2. Any meeting of a mediator with either party or both parties to the meeting and negotiating process
3. Any hearing, meeting, or investigation conducted by a factfinder or arbitrator
4. Any executive (closed) session of the district or between the district and its designated representative for the purpose of discussing its position regarding any matter within the scope of representation and instructing its designated representatives

(cf. 4140/4240/4340 - Bargaining Units)

(cf. 4143/4243 - Negotiations/Consultation)

(cf. 4143.1/4243.1 - Public Notice - Personnel Negotiations)

Note: The Board is authorized pursuant to Government Code 54957.6, the "labor exception," to hold closed sessions with the district's designated representatives regarding the salaries, salary schedules, or compensation paid in the form of fringe benefits to its represented and unrepresented employees, including the Superintendent. The Attorney General has opined in 57 Ops. Cal. Atty. Gen. 209 (1974) that a board may not meet in closed session for such purposes without the use of a designated representative who is involved with the "bona fide" negotiations with represented and/or unrepresented employees. The Attorney General's publication The Brown Act: Open Meetings for Local Legislative Bodies also states that the "labor exception" applies to meeting in closed session to instruct its negotiator concerning negotiations with prospective employees.

The Board may meet in closed session to review the Board's position and/or instruct its designated representative regarding salaries, salary schedules, or compensation paid in the form of fringe benefits of its represented and unrepresented employees. Prior to the closed session, the Board shall identify its designated representative in open session. Any closed session held for this purpose may include discussions of the district's available funds and funding priorities, but only insofar as they relate to providing instructions to the Board's designated representative.

Comment [WT2]: Added language for clarification

Attachment B - Use CSBA Sample As Is

(Government Code 54957.6)

(cf. 2121 - Superintendent's Contract)

Closed sessions may take place prior to and during consultations and discussions with representatives of employee organizations and unrepresented employees. For unrepresented employees, closed sessions held pursuant to Government Code 54957.6 shall not include final action on the proposed compensation of one or more unrepresented employees. (Government Code 54957.6)

For represented employees, the Board may also meet in closed session regarding any other matter within the statutorily provided scope of representation. (Government Code 54957.6)

The Board also may meet in closed session with a state conciliator or mediator who has intervened in proceedings regarding any of the purposes enumerated in Government Code 54957.6.

Agenda items related to negotiations shall specify the name of the district's designated representative(s) attending the closed session. If circumstances necessitate the absence of a specified designated representative, an agent or designee may participate in place of the absent representative as long as the name of the agent or designee is announced at an open session held prior to the closed session. The agenda shall also specify the name of the organization representing the employee(s) or the position title of the unrepresented employee who is the subject of the negotiations. (Government Code 54954.5)

Matters Related to Students

The Board shall meet in closed session to consider the expulsion of a student, unless the student submits a written request at least five days before the date of the hearing that the hearing be held in open session. Regardless of whether the expulsion hearing is conducted in open or closed session, the Board may meet in closed session for the purpose of deliberating and determining whether the student should be expelled. (Education Code 48918)

(cf. 5144.1 - Suspension and Expulsion/Due Process)

(cf. 5144.2 - Suspension and Expulsion/Due Process (Students with Disabilities))

The Board shall meet in closed session to address any student matter that may involve disclosure of confidential student information, or to consider a suspension, disciplinary action, or any other action against a student except expulsion. If a written request for open session is received from the parent/guardian or adult student, it will be honored to the extent that it does not violate the privacy rights of any other student. (Education Code 35146, 48912, 49070)

(cf. 5117 - Interdistrict Attendance)

(cf. 5119 - Students Expelled from Other Districts)

(cf. 5125.3 - Challenging Student Records)

Attachment B - Use CSBA Sample As Is

(cf. 5144 - Discipline)

Note: Although Government Code 54954.2 requires the agenda to have a brief general description of all closed session items to be discussed, Government Code 54954.5 provides no specific description of agenda items related to closed sessions authorized by the Education Code. Since the purpose of conducting the closed session is to protect student privacy rights, the following optional paragraph provides that student names shall not be included on the agenda.

Agenda items related to student matters shall briefly describe the reason for the closed session, such as "student expulsion hearing" or "grade change appeal," without violating the confidentiality rights of individual students. The student shall not be named on the agenda, but a number may be assigned to the student in order to facilitate record keeping. The agenda shall also state that the Education Code requires closed sessions in these cases in order to prevent the disclosure of confidential student record information.

(cf. 5125 - Student Records)

Security Matters

The Board may meet in closed session with the Governor, Attorney General, district attorney, district legal counsel, sheriff or chief of police, or their respective deputies, or a security consultant or a security operations manager, on matters posing a threat to the security of public buildings; to the security of essential public services, including water, drinking water, wastewater treatment, natural gas service, and electric service; or to the public's right of access to public services or public facilities. (Government Code 54957)

(cf. 0450 - Comprehensive Safety Plan)

(cf. 3515 - Campus Security)

(cf. 3516 - Emergencies and Disaster Preparedness Plan)

Note: Government Code 54956.5 authorizes an emergency meeting in closed session to meet with the law enforcement officials specified above pursuant to Government Code 54957. Two-thirds of the Board members present at the meeting must agree to the need for the closed session. Those emergency situations that necessitate a need for an emergency meeting are listed in BB 9320 - Meetings and Notices and include a terrorist attack, crippling disaster, or other activity that impairs public health or safety. For a list of actions for which more than a majority vote of the Board is required, see BB 9323.2 - Actions by the Board.

The Board may meet in closed session during an emergency meeting held pursuant to Government Code 54956.5 to meet with law enforcement officials for the emergency purposes specified in Government Code 54957 if agreed to by a two-thirds vote of the Board members present. If less than two-thirds of the members are present, then the Board must agree by a unanimous vote of the members present. (Government Code 54956.5)

Attachment B - Use CSBA Sample As Is

Agenda items related to security matters shall specify the name of the law enforcement agency and the title of the officer, or name of applicable agency representative and title, with whom the Board will consult. (Government Code 54954.5)

Conference with Real Property Negotiator

Note: An Attorney General opinion (94 Ops.Cal.Atty.Gen. 82 (2011)) has concluded that only three subjects related to real property negotiations may be considered in closed session: (1) the amount of consideration the local agency is willing to pay or accept in exchange for the real property rights to be acquired or transferred; (2) the form, manner, and timing of how that consideration will be paid; and (3) items that are essential to arriving at the authorized price and payment terms. Although Attorney General opinions are not binding, they are accorded deference by the courts.

The Board may meet in closed session with its real property negotiator prior to the purchase, sale, exchange, or lease of real property by or for the district in order to grant its negotiator authority regarding the price and terms of payment for the property. (Government Code 54956.8)

Before holding the closed session, the Board shall hold an open and public session to identify its negotiator(s) and the property under negotiation and to specify the person(s) with whom the negotiator may negotiate. (Government Code 54956.8)

For purposes of real property transactions, negotiators may include members of the Board. (Government Code 54956.8)

Agenda items related to real property negotiations shall specify the district negotiator attending the closed session. If circumstances necessitate the absence of a specified negotiator, an agent or designee may participate in place of the absent negotiator as long as the name of the agent or designee is announced at an open session held prior to the closed session. The agenda shall also specify the name of the negotiating parties and the street address of the real property under negotiation. If there is no street address, the agenda item shall specify the parcel number or another unique reference of the property. The agenda item shall also specify whether instruction to the negotiator will concern price, terms of payment, or both. (Government Code 54954.5)

Pending Litigation

Based on the advice of its legal counsel, the Board may hold a closed session to confer with or receive advice from its legal counsel regarding a pending litigation when a discussion of the matter in open session would prejudice the district's position in the litigation. For this purpose, "litigation" means any adjudicatory proceeding, including eminent domain, before a court, administrative body exercising its adjudicatory authority, hearing officer, or arbitrator. (Government Code 54956.9)

***Note: Pursuant to Government Code 54956.9, the district is considered to be a "party," or to

Attachment B - Use CSBA Sample As Is

have "significant exposure," to a litigation if any of its officers or employees is a party or has significant exposure to the litigation under circumstances specified in items #1 and #2 below.***

Litigation is considered "pending" in any of the following circumstances: (Government Code 54956.9)

1. Litigation to which the district is a "party" has been initiated formally. (Government Code 54956.9(a))

2. A point has been reached where, in the Board's opinion based on the advice of its legal counsel regarding the "existing facts and circumstances," there is a "significant exposure to litigation" against the district, or the Board is meeting solely to determine whether, based on existing facts or circumstances, a closed session is authorized. (Government Code 54956.9(b))

Existing facts and circumstances for these purposes are limited to the following: (Government Code 54956.9)

a. Facts and circumstances that might result in litigation against the district but which the district believes are not yet known to potential plaintiffs and which do not need to be disclosed.

b. Facts and circumstances including, but not limited to, an accident, disaster, incident, or transactional occurrence which might result in litigation against the district, which are already known to potential plaintiffs and which must be publicly disclosed before the closed session or specified on the agenda.

c. The receipt of a claim pursuant to the Tort Claims Act or a written threat of litigation from a potential plaintiff. The claim or written communication must be available for public inspection.

(cf. 3320 - Claims and Actions Against the District)

d. A threat of litigation made by a person in an open meeting on a specific matter within the responsibility of the Board.

e. A threat of litigation made by a person outside of an open meeting on a specific matter within the responsibility of the Board, provided that the district official or employee receiving knowledge of the threat made a record of the statement before the meeting and the record is available for public inspection. Such record does not need to identify an alleged victim of tortious sexual conduct or anyone making a threat on his/her behalf or identify an employee who is the alleged perpetrator of any unlawful or tortious conduct, unless the identity of this person has been publicly disclosed.

3. Based on existing facts and circumstances, the Board has decided to initiate or is deciding whether to initiate litigation. (Government Code 54956.9(c))

Attachment B - Use CSBA Sample As Is

Before holding a closed session pursuant to the pending litigation exception, the Board shall state on the agenda or publicly announce the subdivision of Government Code 54956.9 under which the closed session is being held. If authority is based on Government Code 54956.9(a), the Board shall either state the title or specifically identify the litigation to be discussed or state that doing so would jeopardize the district's ability to effectuate service of process upon unserved parties or to conclude existing settlement negotiations to its advantage. (Government Code 54956.9)

Agenda items related to pending litigation shall be described as a conference with legal counsel regarding either "existing litigation" or "anticipated litigation." (Government Code 54954.5)

"Existing litigation" items shall identify the name of the case specified by either the claimant's name, names of parties, or case or claim number, unless the Board states that to identify the case would jeopardize service of process or existing settlement negotiations. (Government Code 54954.5)

"Anticipated litigation" items shall state that there is significant exposure to litigation pursuant to Government Code 54956.9(b) and shall specify the potential number of cases. When the district expects to initiate a suit, items related to anticipated litigation shall state that the discussion relates to the initiation of litigation pursuant to Government Code 54956.9(c) and shall specify the potential number of cases. The agenda or an oral statement before the closed session may be required to provide additional information regarding existing facts and circumstances described in item #2 b-e above. (Government Code 54954.5)

Joint Powers Agency Issues

Note: The following section applies to districts participating in a joint powers agency (JPA) for insurance pooling or in a self-insurance authority.

The Board may meet in closed session to discuss a claim for the payment of tort liability losses, public liability losses, or workers' compensation liability incurred by a joint powers agency (JPA) formed for the purpose of insurance pooling or self-insurance authority of which the district is a member. (Government Code 54956.95)

Closed session agenda items related to liability claims shall specify the claimant's name and the name of the agency against which the claim is made. (Government Code 54954.5)

(cf. 3530 - Risk Management/Insurance)

Note: Pursuant to Government Code 54956.96, a JPA may adopt a provision, either through a policy or through the joint powers agreement, authorizing a school district Board member serving on the JPA board to disclose confidential information received during the JPA board's closed session under the circumstances specified below. Government Code 54954.5 provides an agenda description for the purpose of this closed session. The following optional paragraphs are for use by districts that participate in a JPA that has adopted such a provision.

Attachment B - Use CSBA Sample As Is

When the board of the JPA has so authorized and upon advice of district legal counsel, the Board may meet in closed session in order to receive, discuss, and take action concerning information obtained in a closed session of the JPA. During the Board's closed session, a Board member serving on the JPA board may disclose confidential information acquired during a closed session of the JPA to fellow Board members. (Government Code 54956.96)

The Board member may also disclose the confidential JPA information to district legal counsel in order to obtain advice on whether the matter has direct financial or liability implications for the district. (Government Code 54956.96)

Closed session agenda items related to conferences involving a JPA shall specify the closed session description used by the JPA and the name of the Board member representing the district on the JPA board. Additional information listing the names of agencies or titles of representatives attending the closed session as consultants or other representatives shall also be included. (Government Code 54954.5)

Review of Audit Report from California State Auditor's Office

Note: Government Code 54956.75 authorizes the Board to meet in closed session to discuss a final draft audit report from the California State Auditor's Office. This authority relates to situations in which a member of the legislature has requested the California State Auditor's Office to audit a school district. This audit is separate from the annual audit that districts must conduct pursuant to Education Code 41020. The law does not authorize the Board to meet in closed session to discuss the district's annual audit.

Upon receipt of a confidential final draft audit report from the California State Auditor's Office, the Board may meet in closed session to discuss its response to that report. After public release of the report from the California State Auditor's Office, any Board meeting to discuss the report must be conducted in open session, unless exempted from that requirement by some other provision of law. (Government Code 54956.75)

Closed session agenda items related to an audit by the California State Auditor's Office shall state "Audit by California State Auditor's Office." (Government Code 54954.5)

Review of Assessment Instruments

The Board may meet in closed session to review the contents of any student assessment instrument approved or adopted for the statewide testing system. Before any such meeting, the Board shall agree by resolution to accept any terms or conditions established by the State Board of Education for this review. (Education Code 60617)

(cf. 6162.5 - Student Assessment)

Attachment B - Use CSBA Sample As Is

Note: The following optional paragraph provides for compliance with Government Code 54954.2, which requires the agenda to have a brief general description of all closed session items to be discussed. Government Code 54954.5 provides no specific description of agenda items related to closed sessions authorized by the Education Code.

Agenda items related to the review of student assessment instruments shall state that the Board is reviewing the contents of an assessment instrument approved or adopted for the statewide testing program and that Education Code 60617 authorizes a closed session for this purpose in order to maintain the confidentiality of the assessment under review.

Legal Reference:

EDUCATION CODE

35145 Public meetings
35146 Closed session (re student suspension)
44929.21 Districts with ADA of 250 or more
48912 Governing board suspension
48918 Rules governing expulsion procedures; hearings and notice
49070 Challenging content of students records
60617 Meetings of governing board

GOVERNMENT CODE

3540-3549.3 Educational Employment Relations Act
6252-6270 California Public Records Act
54950-54963 The Ralph M. Brown Act

COURT DECISIONS

Morrison v. Housing Authority of the City of Los Angeles Board of Commissioners, (2003) 107 Cal.App.4th 860
Bell v. Vista Unified School District, (2001) 82 Cal.App. 4th 672
Fischer v. Los Angeles Unified School District, (1999) 70 Cal.App. 4th 87
Furtado v. Sierra Community College District (1998) 68 Cal.App. 4th 876
Roberts v. City of Palmdale, (1993) 5 Cal.App. 4th 363
Sacramento Newspaper Guild v. Sacramento County Board of Supervisors, (1968) 263 Cal.App. 2d 41
San Diego Union v. City Council, (1983) 146 Cal.App.3d 947

ATTORNEY GENERAL OPINIONS

94 Ops.Cal.Atty.Gen. 82 (2011)
86 Ops.Cal.Atty.Gen. 210 (2003)
78 Ops.Cal.Atty.Gen. 218 (1995)
59 Ops.Cal.Atty.Gen. 532 (1976)
57 Ops. Cal. Atty. Gen. 209 (1974)

Management Resources:

CSBA PUBLICATIONS

Attachment B - Use CSBA Sample As Is

The Brown Act: School Boards and Open Meeting Laws, 2009

ATTORNEY GENERAL PUBLICATIONS

The Brown Act: Open Meetings for Legislative Bodies, 2003

LEAGUE OF CALIFORNIA CITIES PUBLICATIONS

Open and Public IV: A Guide to the Ralph M. Brown Act, rev. July 2010

WEB SITES

CSBA: <http://www.csba.org>

California Attorney General's Office: <http://www.oag.ca.gov>

League of California Cities: <http://www.cacities.org>

(7/12 12/14) 06/16